UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20460

APR 11 2012

OFFICE OF AIR AND RADIATION

Dr. Jim p.K. Ziegler
Department of Chemical Engineering
Clarkson University
3 Clarkson Avenue, Box 5705
Potsdam, New York 13699-5705

Dear Dr. Ziegler:

Thank you for the SAB Clean Air Scientific Advisory Committee's Particulate Matter Review Panel for its thoughtful and providing advice concerning the *Proposed Methodology for Particulate Matter Risk Analysis for Selected Urban Areas* (EPA-452/R-12-01, 2012).

The Agency's advice and discussion have been very helpful to the Office of Air Quality Planning and Standards (OAQPS) as we continue to organize review of the PM National Ambient Air Quality Standards. Comments the Panel made about the *Proposed Methodology for Particulate Matter Risk Analysis for Selected Urban Areas* described aspects of the general approach taken and will be helpful in this risk analysis. In response to the Panel's specific comments, we are using on the details of the method's application.

In response, OAQPS plans to expand the scope of the risk analyses to include analyses of the PM$_{2.5}$ data for PM$_{2.5}$ as well as PM$_{10}$ and to add an additional focus on which PM$_{2.5}$ has primarily driven risk based effects. It would be a mistake to only be using both PM$_{2.5}$ and coarse PM (PM$_{10-2.5}$) to address high risk areas, since it is the aggregated risk analysis described by Smith in the report that is of most interest and most relevant to the analysis. OAQPS may well also identify areas for which MPRC may agree to consider in their review of the Agency's conclusions for the NAAQS.

OAQPS has arranged a teleconference with the Panel for May 1, 2012 to discuss plans for the forthcoming analysis of PM$_{2.5}$ and coarse particles. Please let Agency's planners, PM staff members, Jim Smith or Lucas Glover, EPA staff members, know if you need documents from them, for example, or for the Panel to be engaged earlier in reviewing materials ahead of time. Thank you for your advice and review of Smith's PM Risk Report and the materials for the Panel's review.

Thank you for your continuing contribution to the Agency's review of the PM NAAQS.

Sincerely yours,

Stephen D. Page, Director
Health and Environmental Impacts Division

Recycled/Recyclable